

From: [Crane, Drew](#)
To: [Rick Sayers](#)
Subject: Fwd: Draft 316b ESA Biological Evaluation Follow up
Date: Friday, March 15, 2013 11:42:15 AM

Hi Rick,

Below is the email string starting from when we received the draft BE from EPA.
Two questions for you:

(b)(5) Deliberative Process



Thanks
Drew

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Paul, Keith** <keith_paul@fws.gov>
Date: Fri, Mar 15, 2013 at 8:29 AM
Subject: Fwd: Draft 316b ESA Biological Evaluation Follow up
To: Drew Crane <drew_crane@fws.gov>

Keith A Paul
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
Endangered Species Program
4401 N. Fairfax Drive, Room 452C
Arlington, VA 22203
Phone: (703) 358-2675
Fax: (703) 358-1735
Cell: 530-840-0658 (for WFH days; Mons & 2nd Fri)

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Jennifer Schultz - NOAA Federal** <jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov>
Date: Thu, Mar 14, 2013 at 5:20 PM
Subject: Re: Draft 316b ESA Biological Evaluation Follow up
To: Ron Dean - NOAA Federal <ron.dean@noaa.gov>
Cc: Brad Smith <brad.smith@noaa.gov>, Christina Fahy <christina.fahy@noaa.gov>, Christine Vaccaro <christine.vaccaro@noaa.gov>, Dan Lawson <dan.lawson@noaa.gov>, David Bernhart <david.bernhart@noaa.gov>, Donald Hubner <donald.hubner@noaa.gov>, Eric Hawk <eric.hawk@noaa.gov>, Jason Kahn <jason.kahn@noaa.gov>, Jayne LeFors <jayne.lefors@noaa.gov> ,

Joseph Dillon <joseph.j.dillon@noaa.gov>, Julie Crocker <julie.crocker@noaa.gov>, Larry Swenson <larry.swenson@noaa.gov>, Liz Sullivan <liz.sullivan@noaa.gov>, Mark Murray-Brown <mark.murray-brown@noaa.gov>, Mary Colligan <mary.a.colligan@noaa.gov>, Melanie Harrison <melanie.harrison@noaa.gov>, Mike Tust <mike.tust@noaa.gov>, Pamela Lawrence <pamela.lawrence@noaa.gov>, Pat Shaw-Allen <pat.shaw-allen@noaa.gov>, Patrick Opay <patrick.opay@noaa.gov>, Richard Domingue <richard.domingue@noaa.gov>, Stephania Bolden <stephania.bolden@noaa.gov>, Therese Conant <Therese.Conant@noaa.gov>, Craig Johnson - NOAA Federal <Craig.Johnson@noaa.gov>, "Paul, Keith" <keith_paul@fws.gov>, Cathy Tortorici - NOAA Federal <cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov>

Hi Everyone,

Thanks for meeting today. Enclosed is the draft permit; I've added my comments to Joe's. Please add your comments and send to me by 4:00 PM EST Monday. We will be meeting with EPA on Tuesday at 1:00 PM EST (please feel free to call in; let me know if you need the call in information). We will be talking about the following:

1) (b)(5) Deliberative Process

[REDACTED]

Jenny

Jennifer Schultz, Ph.D.
Endangered Species Act Interagency Cooperation Division
Office of Protected Resources
NOAA Fisheries
U.S. Department of Commerce
[301-427-8443](tel:301-427-8443)

jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov
www.nmfs.noaa.gov



On Sat, Mar 9, 2013 at 11:32 AM, Ron Dean - NOAA Federal <ron.dean@noaa.gov> wrote:

Hi Everyone:

3:00 EST on Thursday the 14th looks like the best time. Pam cannot make it but this is a technical call and we will fill her in.

Thanks everyone,

-Ron

On Fri, Mar 8, 2013 at 10:00 AM, Ron Dean - NOAA Federal

<ron.dean@noaa.gov> wrote:

Hi Everyone:

I have only given this a very cursory view, (b)(5) Deliberative Process

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

These are just my very brief first impressions and I may be missing something.

Comments welcome. Perhaps we should schedule a Services call before next Tuesday?

-Ron

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Born, Tom** <Born.Tom@epa.gov>

Date: Thu, Mar 7, 2013 at 6:09 PM

Subject: Draft 316b ESA Biological Evaluation

To: Ron Dean - NOAA Federal <ron.dean@noaa.gov>, "Paul, Keith"

<keith_paul@fws.gov>, Brad Smith <brad.smith@noaa.gov>,

"christina.fahy@noaa.gov" <christina.fahy@noaa.gov>, Christine Vaccaro

<christine.vaccaro@noaa.gov>, Dan Lawson <dan.lawson@noaa.gov>, David

Bernhart <david.bernhart@noaa.gov>, Donald Hubner

<donald.hubner@noaa.gov>, Eric Hawk <eric.hawk@noaa.gov>, Gina Shultz

<gina.shultz@noaa.gov>, Jason Kahn <jason.kahn@noaa.gov>, Jayne LeFors

<jayne.lefors@noaa.gov>, Jennifer Schultz <jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov>,

Joseph Dillon <joseph.j.dillon@noaa.gov>, "julie.crocker@NOAA.gov"

<julie.crocker@noaa.gov>, Larry Swenson <larry.swenson@noaa.gov>, Liz

Sullivan <liz.sullivan@noaa.gov>, Mark Murray-Brown <mark.murray-brown@noaa.gov>,

Mary Colligan <mary.a.colligan@noaa.gov>, Melanie

Harrison <melanie.harrison@noaa.gov>, Mike Tust <mike.tust@noaa.gov>,

Pamela Lawrence <pamela.lawrence@noaa.gov>, Pat Shaw-Allen <pat.shaw-allen@noaa.gov>, Patrick Opay <patrick.opay@noaa.gov>, Richard Domingue <richard.domingue@noaa.gov>, Stephania Bolden <stephania.bolden@noaa.gov>, Therese Conant <Therese.Conant@noaa.gov>, "drew_crane@fws.gov" <drew_crane@fws.gov>
Cc: "Hewitt, Julie" <Hewitt.Julie@epa.gov>, "Witt, Richard" <Witt.Richard@epa.gov>, "Wade, Alexis" <Wade.Alexis@epa.gov>, "Biddle, Lisa" <Biddle.Lisa@epa.gov>, "Lewis, Samantha" <Lewis.Samantha@epa.gov>, "Hoffman, Wendy" <Hoffman.Wendy@epa.gov>, "Pritts, Jesse" <Pritts.Jesse@epa.gov>

Please review the attached draft 316b ESA biological evaluation. We'll discuss any comments you have on the BE during our next call on March 19.

--

Ron Dean
Office of Protected Resources
NOAA National Marine Fisheries Service
1315 East-West Highway Rm. 13755
Silver Spring, MD 20910
[301.427.8445](tel:301.427.8445)

--

Ron Dean
Office of Protected Resources
NOAA National Marine Fisheries Service
1315 East-West Highway Rm. 13755
Silver Spring, MD 20910
[301.427.8445](tel:301.427.8445)